Air Pollution Reduction and Mortality Benefit during the COVID-19 Outbreak in China

Kai Chen,1 Meng Wang,2 Conghong Huang,2 Patrick L. Kinney,3 Paul T. Anastas1,4

1 Yale School of Public Health, New Haven, CT, USA.
2 University at Buffalo School of Public Health and Health Professions, Buffalo, NY, USA.
3 Boston University School of Public Health, Boston, MA, USA
4 Yale School of Forestry and Environmental Studies, New Haven, CT, USA.

Corresponding author: Dr. Kai Chen. 60 College Street. New Haven, CT. 06520-8034. Email: kai.chen@yale.edu; Tel: (203)737-7004.

Dr. Kai Chen and Dr. Meng Wang contributed equally to this letter.

Conflict of Interest Disclosures: None reported.
To control the novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19) outbreak, China undertook stringent traffic restrictions and self-quarantine measures, first in Wuhan and neighboring cities beginning on January 23, 2020, and two days later, in all provinces in China (Figure 1A). The countrywide ban on traffic mobility greatly limited transportation emissions, whereas emissions from residential heating and industry remained steady or slightly declined. We herein examine the change in air pollution levels and the potentially avoided cause-specific mortality during this massive population quarantine episode.

As of March 14, 2020, new confirmed COVID-19 cases in China reported by the National Health Commission (NHC) dropped to 20 (4 from Wuhan) (Figure 1A). Most Chinese provinces have lowered the level of emergency responses. We thus defined the “during quarantine” period as February 10 to March 14 and the “before quarantine” period as January 5 to 20. We excluded the Chinese New Year holidays to avoid non-quarantine related air pollution reductions, based on evidence from previous years (Figure 1B). We obtained daily concentrations of nitrogen dioxide (NO2) and fine particulate matter (PM2.5) in 367 Chinese cities. We then applied a difference-in-difference approach to quantify air pollution changes due to the quarantine. Specifically, we calculated changes in air quality during vs. before the quarantine period in 2020, and compared these with corresponding changes in the same lunar calendar periods in 2016-2019. Details of the material, methods, and numeric results are provided in the Supplementary Appendix.

We found that, due to the quarantine, NO2 dropped by 22.8 µg/m³ and 12.9 µg/m³ in Wuhan and China, respectively. PM2.5 dropped by 1.4 µg/m³ in Wuhan but decreased by 18.9 µg/m³ across 367 cities. The dramatic decline in NO2 across China during the quarantine period was also detected by the Copernicus Sentinel-5P satellite using the NO2 tropospheric column density (Figure 1C).

We then calculated the avoided cause-specific mortality attributable to these decreases in NO2 and PM2.5 over China based on the concentration-response functions from a previous study of 272 Chinese cities, and the cause-specific mortality data from the China Health and Family Planning Statistical Yearbook 2018. We estimate that improved air quality during the quarantine period avoided a total of 8911 [95 confidence interval (CI): 6950, 10866] NO2-related...
deaths, 65% of which were from cardiovascular diseases (hypertensive disease, coronary heart
disease, and stroke) and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), (Figure 1D). Further,
we estimate that PM$_{2.5}$ reductions during the quarantine period avoided a total of 3214 (95% CI:
2340, 4087) PM$_{2.5}$-related deaths in China, 73% of which were from cardiovascular diseases and
COPD. These numbers should be interpreted with caution due to the potential overlap between
PM$_{2.5}$- and NO$_2$-related mortality and the disrupted healthcare systems during quarantine to
c conducive timely treatment for patients with chronic diseases.

We conclude that interventions to contain the COVID-19 outbreak led to air quality
improvements that brought health benefits which outnumbered the confirmed deaths due to
COVID-19 in China (3199 deaths as of March 14, 2020). These findings illustrate the
substantial human health benefits related to cardiovascular disease morbidity and mortality that
can be achieved when aggressive air pollution control measures are taken to reduce emissions
from vehicles, such as through climate mitigation-related traffic restrictions or efforts to
accelerate the transition to electric vehicles.

References

1. Heavy air pollution in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei and surrounding areas and five experts
nationwide analysis in 272 Chinese cities. American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care
4. Update on the novel coronavirus pneumonia outbreak. National Health Commission of
the People’s Republic of China,. (Accessed March 18, 2020, at
http://www.nhc.gov.cn/xcs/yqtb/list_gzbd.shtml.)
Figure 1. Air pollution levels and avoided cause-specific deaths during the COVID-19 outbreak in China.

A COVID-19 and quarantine measures in China

- Wuhan implemented strict travel restrictions.
- All provinces in mainland China except Tibet have launched the highest level of emergency responses.
- Hubei Province first lowered response level.
- 24 provinces have lowered response levels.

B Air pollution levels in China before and during the quarantine

- NO2 and PM2.5 levels in Wuhan, Hubei (Outside Wuhan), and China (Outside Hubei).

C NO2 density changes during vs. before the quarantine

- Maps showing NO2 density changes before and during the quarantine.

D Avoided deaths due to air pollution reduction during the quarantine

- Avoided deaths for various causes (hypertensive disease, coronary heart disease, stroke, COPD, other diseases) during the quarantine.