

1 Title:

2 Closed environments facilitate secondary transmission of coronavirus disease 2019

3 (COVID-19)

4 Running title: Closed environment and COVID-19

5 Authors:

6 Hiroshi Nishiura, M.D., Ph.D.<sup>1,2</sup>, Hitoshi Oshitani, M.D., Ph.D.<sup>1,3</sup>, Tetsuro Kobayashi,

7 M.D.<sup>1,2</sup>, Tomoya Saito, M.D., M.P.H., Ph.D.<sup>1,4</sup>, Tomimasa Sunagawa, M.D., Ph.D.<sup>1,5</sup>,

8 Tamano Matsui, M.D., Ph.D.<sup>1,5</sup>, Takaji Wakita, M.D., Ph.D.<sup>1,5</sup>, MHLW COVID-19

9 Response Team<sup>1</sup>, Motoi Suzuki, M.D., Ph.D.<sup>1,5</sup>

10 1. Cluster Intervention Group, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Kasumigaseki

11 1-2-2, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-8916, Japan

12 2. Graduate School of Medicine, Hokkaido University, Kia 15 Jo Nishi 7 Chome,

13 Kitaku, Sapporo, 060-8638, Japan

14 3. Tohoku University Graduate School of Medicine, Seiryochō 2-1, Aoba-ku, Sendai,

15 980-8575, Japan

16 4. National Institute of Public Health, 5. National Institute of Infectious Diseases,

17 Toyama 1-23-1, Shinjuku-ku, Tokyo 162-8640, Japan

18 (Correspondence to Hiroshi Nishiura at: Address: Kita 15 Jo Nishi 7 Chome, Kita-ku,

19 Sapporo-shi, Hokkaido 060-8638, Japan, Tel: +81-11-706-5066; Fax: +81-11-706-7819;

20 Email: nishiurah@med.hokudai.ac.jp)

21

22 **Abstract**

23 **Objective:** To identify common features of cases with novel coronavirus disease

24 (COVID-19) so as to better understand what factors promote secondary transmission

25 including superspreading events.

26 **Methods:** A total of 110 cases were examined among eleven clusters and sporadic cases,

27 and investigated who acquired infection from whom. The clusters included four in

28 Tokyo and one each in Aichi, Fukuoka, Hokkaido, Ishikawa, Kanagawa and Wakayama

29 prefectures. The number of secondary cases generated by each primary case was

30 calculated using contact tracing data.

31 **Results:** Of the 110 cases examined, 27 (24.6%) were primary cases who generated

32 secondary cases. The odds that a primary case transmitted COVID-19 in a closed

33 environment was 18.7 times greater compared to an open-air environment (95%

34 confidence interval [CI]: 6.0, 57.9).

35 **Conclusions:** It is plausible that closed environments contribute to secondary

36 transmission of COVID-19 and promote superspreading events. Our findings are also

37 consistent with the declining incidence of COVID-19 cases in China, as gathering in

38 closed environments was prohibited in the wake of the rapid spread of the disease.

39

## 40 Introduction

41 Although the incidence of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in China began to  
42 decrease in February 2020,<sup>1</sup> many countries are struggling with containment of the  
43 disease. To effectively reduce the spread of COVID-19, it is vital to identify common  
44 features of cases so as to better understand what factors promote superspreading events,<sup>2</sup>  
45 wherein an extraordinarily large number of secondary transmissions are produced by a  
46 single primary case. Commissioned by the Minister of the Ministry of Health, Labour,  
47 and Welfare of Japan, we collected secondary transmission data with the aim of  
48 identifying high risk transmission settings.

## 49 Methods

50 As of 28 February 2020,<sup>3</sup> we examined a total of 110 cases among eleven  
51 clusters and sporadic cases, and investigated who acquired infection from whom. The  
52 clusters included four in Tokyo and one each in Aichi, Fukuoka, Hokkaido, Ishikawa,  
53 Kanagawa and Wakayama prefectures. All traced transmission events were examined in  
54 relation to close contact in indoor environments, including fitness gyms, a restaurant  
55 boat on a river, hospitals, and a snow festival where there were eating spaces in tents  
56 with minimal ventilation rate. The number of secondary cases generated by each  
57 primary case was calculated using contact tracing data.

## 58 Results

59 Of the 110 cases examined, 27 (24.6%) were primary cases who generated  
60 secondary cases. Figure 1 shows the distribution of these transmissions, of which the  
61 mean and variance were 0.6 cases and 2.5 cases<sup>2</sup>, respectively. The odds that a primary

62 case transmitted COVID-19 in a closed environment was 18.7 times greater compared  
63 to an open-air environment (95% confidence interval [CI]: 6.0, 57.9).

64 If superspreading events are defined as events where the number of secondary  
65 cases generated by a single primary case is greater than the 95th percentile of the  
66 distribution (i.e. transmission to three or more persons), then seven of the 110 cases  
67 (6.4%) were involved in such events. Six of these events (85.7%) took place in closed  
68 environments, and the odds ratio (OR) of superspreading events in closed environments  
69 was as high as 32.6 (95% CI: 3.7, 289.5).

## 70 Discussion

71 It is plausible that closed environments contribute to secondary transmission of  
72 COVID-19 and promote superspreading events. Closed environments are consistent with  
73 environmental sampling study<sup>4</sup> and also large-scale COVID-19 transmission events such  
74 as that of the ski chalet-associated cluster in France and the church- and  
75 hospital-associated clusters in South Korea<sup>5</sup>. Our findings are also consistent with the  
76 declining incidence of COVID-19 cases in China, as gathering in closed environments  
77 was prohibited in the wake of the rapid spread of the disease.

78 Reduction of unnecessary close contact in closed environments may help  
79 prevent large case clusters and superspreading events. We hope that with such a  
80 reduction in contact the reproduction number of COVID-19 in Japan will be maintained  
81 below 1 and contact tracing will be sufficient to contain disease spread.<sup>6</sup> As the  
82 possibility of confounders and interactions was not assessed in this study, additional  
83 studies must be conducted to verify the importance of closed environments as  
84 facilitators for transmission of COVID-19.

85

86 **Conflict of interest:**

87 We declare that we have no conflict of interest.

88 **Acknowledgement:**

89 We sincerely thank staff of local governments, including health centers and prefectural  
90 institutes of public health, healthcare facilities, and associated companies and  
91 organizations for cooperating us to collect and investigate secondary transmission data.  
92 H.N. received funding support from Japan Agency for Medical Research and  
93 Development [grant number: JP18fk0108050] and the Japan Science and Technology  
94 Agency (JST) Core Research for Evolutional Science and Technology (CREST)  
95 program [grant number: JPMJCR1413].

96

97 **References:**

- 98 1. The Novel Coronavirus Pneumonia Emergency Response Epidemiology Team. Vital  
99 Surveillances: The Epidemiological Characteristics of an Outbreak of 2019 Novel  
100 Coronavirus Diseases (COVID-19) — China, 2020. China CDC Weekly  
101 2020;2(8):113-122.
- 102 2. Lloyd-Smith JO, Schreiber SJ, Kopp PE, Getz WM. Superspreading and the effect of  
103 individual variation on disease emergence. Nature 2005;438:355-359.
- 104 3. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Japan. On the novel coronavirus infection.  
105 Tokyo: Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, 2020. Available online from:  
106 [https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/seisakunitsuite/bunya/0000164708\\_00001.html](https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/seisakunitsuite/bunya/0000164708_00001.html) (accessed  
107 on 26 February 2020).
- 108 4. Ong SWX, Tan YK, Chia PY, Lee TH, Ng OT, Wong MSY, Marimuthu K. Air,

109 Surface Environmental, and Personal Protective Equipment Contamination by Severe  
110 Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) From a Symptomatic  
111 Patient. JAMA. 2020; in press. doi: 10.1001/jama.2020.3227.

112 5. Promed mail. Subject: PRO/AH/EDR> COVID-19 update (19): China, global, Italy  
113 & Iran. imported cases, WHO. Archive Number: 20200226.7029842

114 6. Grantz K, Metcalf JE, Lessler J. Dispersion vs. control. 2020. Available online from:  
115 <https://hopkinsidd.github.io/nCoV-Sandbox/DispersionExploration.html> (accessed on  
116 26 February 2020).

117

## 118 Figure legend

119 Figure 1. The distribution of the number of secondary cases generated by a single  
120 primary case with novel coronavirus (COVID-19). The mean and variance were 0.6  
121 cases and 2.5 cases<sup>2</sup>, respectively.

