The Paradox of Female Obesity in Low and Lower-Middle Income Countries

Corresponding Author
Lincoln R. Sheets, MD, PhD
204 Medical Science Building
University of Missouri School of Medicine
Columbia, MO 65212, USA
SheetsLR@health.missouri.edu
417-860-1197

Co-Authors
Cynthia Y. Tang, BS
Department of Medicine
University of Missouri School of Medicine
Columbia, Missouri
United States of America

Henok G. Woldu, PhD
Department of Health Management and Informatics
University of Missouri School of Medicine
Columbia, Missouri
United States of America

Word Count: 2015

Keywords:
Obesity, Social Determinants of Health, Education

ABSTRACT

Setting: Obesity, once considered an epidemic of the developed world, is now becoming an even more prominent problem than underweight in low and lower-middle income countries (LLMICs). Ample literature has shown that as a country's income increases, the burden of obesity shifts from the rich to the poor. Many studies have explored the effects of various social determinants of health on obesity, but few have studied the association between obesity and education. Additionally, while some data exists on the association in men, there have been limited comprehensive studies focusing on the relationship in the female population of LLMICs.
Objective: Globally, adult females have a higher prevalence of obesity and the obesity shift occurs more quickly for women than for men. We aim to address this disparity and explore the association of education and obesity in women.
Design: In this cross-sectional study, we used a multi-national and multi-year database from the publicly available Demographic and Health Surveys program with data from 34 LLMICs.
Results: Our age-adjusted analysis shows that women in LLMICs with higher education have a significantly greater prevalence of obesity than women with no education. We analyzed this phenomenon by individual nations, continents, and income classifications. Educated women living in low income countries are 5.12 times more likely to be obese than uneducated women (APR, 95% CI=4.75, 5.32) and 3.48 times (APR, 95% CI=3.37, 3.60) more likely in lower-middle income countries.
Conclusion: These findings highlight a need for more studies and policy attention focusing on female education levels to understand, predict, and prevent obesity in LLMICs.

ARTICLE SUMMARY
Strengths and limitations of this study
- A rigorous sample size of 836,721 adult females in 34 LLMIC countries was utilized to study the association between adult female obesity and education level.
- Age-adjusted prevalence ratios of obesity were analyzed based on 34 individual nations, three continents, and two income categories.
- This study is limited by the relatively small number of countries for which data is available through the DHS dataset, and thus, further research will be needed to show whether these results are generalizable to other LLMICs.
- The results cannot be generalized to higher-income countries or to men in LLMICs, and do not account for intra-national variability.

INTRODUCTION

The worldwide prevalence of obesity has nearly tripled since 1975. [1] Once an epidemic of developed countries, obesity is becoming increasingly problematic in low and lower-middle income countries (LLMICs), surpassing the issue of underweight.[1] According to the Global Burden of Diseases, Injuries, and Risk Factors Study in 2017, high body mass index (BMI) has had a greater relative increase in exposure since 1990 than most of the other 83 risk factors that were evaluated.[2] Obesity is a primary risk factor for various medical conditions including ischemic heart disease and stroke, both of which are among the top 5 causes of deaths in LLMICs.[3; 4] In 2015 alone, overweight and obesity were associated with 4.0 million deaths globally.[5] BMI is a modifiable risk factor, and thus, obesity is both a treatable and preventable condition. Understanding where and why it occurs is important in improving health outcomes.

It is well-evidenced that the burden of obesity shifts from the rich to the poor as a country's income level increases.[6] In low income countries, the poor are "protected" against obesity, while in high income countries, they are more susceptible. The shift in obesity has been seen to be associated with wealth, socioeconomic status, and education.[7] Furthermore, adult females have a higher prevalence of obesity, and the intra-national shift of obesity from rich to poor occurs more quickly for women.[8] There have been limited comprehensive studies

focusing on the relationship between obesity and education in the female population of LLMICs, and we aim to address that disparity in this study. We focus on the paradoxical phenomenon between obesity and education in adult females of LLMICs by analyzing the relationship by individual nations, global regions, and World Bank income classifications. We hypothesize that this association can be generalized to other LLMICs globally.

Objective
Unlike in high income countries, we hypothesize that higher levels of education are associated with higher levels of obesity among adult women in LLMICs.

METHODS

Population
Five inclusion criteria were used: (a) Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) results were available since 2008, (b) the survey results included body-mass index (BMI) values, (c) the survey results included education levels, (d) the country was classified by the World Bank as a "low income" (Gross National Income per capita of less than 995 USD) or "lower-middle income" (Gross National Income per capita between 996 and 3895 USD) economy,[9] and (e) survey results were from women of reproductive age (ages 15 to 49). Women who were pregnant were excluded from analysis.

Table 1. Demographics data of 34 LLMICS

Region	Countries (n)	Women (n)	Mean Age (SD)
Africa	24	174,774	28.56 (9.61)
Asia	7	721,476	30.17 (10.02)
Latin America	3	47,697	29.01 (9.92)
Low Income	19	146,131	29.14 (10.43)
Low Middle Income	15	797,628	29.94 (9.87)
Combined	34	836,721	29.82 (9.96)

SD = Standard Deviation

Patient and Public Invovlement
Patient and public involvement (PPI) were not directly included in this study. However, the DHS database used in the study was developed with PPI in the form of survey responses.

Data Sources
Data were obtained from the Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) program. The DHS program is a multi-national and multi-year publicly available database funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The DHS program has collected data from greater than 400 surveys in over 90 developing countries or countries receiving foreign aid from the United States. Sample weights were used by the DHS program to adjust for over- and under-sampling within different regions of each country to ensure proper representation. Education is categorized as no education, primary, secondary, or higher than secondary and is reported as the highest level of education attended. Surveys are generally conducted every five years.[10] Data from the most recent surveys available at the time of analysis were used for this study ranging from 2008 to 2018.

Data Elements
The main outcome variable is body mass index (BMI). The World Health Organization (WHO) classifies obesity as BMI above 30 kg/m^2.[11] Covariate variables including country name, urban or rural category, age, education level, and household wealth index were studied. Urban or rural category has been explored in our previous study, showing that urban disadvantage is associated with more obesity than rural disadvantage, and therefore is omitted in this study. [12] The income class of each country was based on the World Bank Atlas Method for the 2019 fiscal year.[13] Of the 836,721 surveys available, 109 contained missing records on BMI

and education. Missing data was ommitted from analysis. Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) reporting guidelines were used [14].

Data Sharing: Dataset is available through the Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) program.

Statistical Methodology

In step one, we used descriptive statistics to explore the data for each of the the 34 countries. The mean (+/- SD) of BMI was calculated for each country along with the total number of women included in the analysis. BMI of greater than 60 kg/m^2 were excluded from analysis as these values are most likely reported in error. In step two, the crude prevelance ratio of obesity by education level was caculated at the individual country, continent, and country income classification levels. Household wealth index and education were found to be colinear variables. Thus, we excluded household wealth index from our analysis. Finally, a generalized linear model with binomial distribution and logarithmic link function was used to estimate the age-adjusted prevalence ratio (APR) of obesity for females with higher than secondary, or high school equivalent, education and females with no education in LLMICs. Age was adjusted for as a confounding factor due to its variability with different age groups.[15] In addition to the APR, the 95% confidence interval (CI) of the APR was presented. A two sided 0.05 alpha level of significance was used to determine the statistical significance of the results. A 95% CI of the APR that does not include one was considered statistically significant. All statistical analyses were performed using SAS software 9.4.[16]

RESULTS

A total of 34 countries fit our inclusion criteria. To analyze the relationship between education level and obesity in women in LLMICs, we began by searching the DHS database and found data covering 19 low income countries and 15 lower-middle countries (Table 1). Using this dataset, we compared obesity in women with no education to those with post-secondary level education to calculate the age adjusted prevalence ratio (APR) (Figure 1) and confidence interval (CI) for each country.

Our results show that women in LLMICs with higher than secondary education have a significantly greater prevalence of obesity than women with no education (APR=3.71, CI=3.58, 3.85) (Table 2). We found statistical significance (P-value < 0.001) of this phenomenon in 28 of the 34 countries analyzed, with the exceptions being Comoros, Cote d'Ivoire, Sao Tome, Tajikistan, Timor Leste, and Bolivia. After adjusting for age, we found that highly educated women living in low income countries are 5.12 times more likely to be obese than uneducated women (APR=5.12, 95% CI=4.73, 5.53). Highly educated women living in lower-middle income countries are 3.48 times more likely to be obese than uneducated women (APR=3.48, 95% CI=3.37, 3.60). The highest disparity is seen in Burundi (APR of 27.36, 95% CI=13.59, 55.05), and the lowest significant disparities are seen in Honduras (APR=1.75, 95% CI=1.51, 2.04) and Pakistan (APR=1.50, 95% CI=1.29, 1.75). Of the nations analyzed in Africa, the average APR is 4.98 (95% CI=4.66, 5.31); in Asia, the average APR is 3.67 (95% CI=3.53, 3.82); and in Latin America, the average APR is 1.67 (95% CI=1.51, 1.88).

Table 2– Age-Adjusted Obesity Prevalence By Education Level.

Country	Women (n)	Income Class	Survey Year	Mean BMI (SD)	Obesity Prevalence Based on Education Level				PR	APR	95% CI APR	APR P-Value
					None	Primary	Secondary	Higher				
Benin	7291	Low	2017-2018	23.13 (4.85)	7.69	12.16	9.34	24.38	3.17	5.14	(3.77, 7.01)	< 0.001
Burundi	8009	Low	2016-2017	21.04 (3.25)	0.76	1.63	3.76	11.65	15.33	27.36	(13.59, 55.05)	< 0.001
Cameroon	7335	Lower-middle	2011	23.88 (4.79)	4.49	10.65	11.31	18.57	4.14	5.53	(3.98 , 7.68)	< 0.001
Comoros	5083	Low	2012	24.42 (4.95)	17.15	14.12	8.84	13.18	0.77	1.03	(0.08, 1.34)	0.794
Congo	5191	Lower-middle	2011-2012	22.27 (4.12)	2.76	2.64	7.82	10.48	3.80	4.78	(2.24, 10.19)	< 0.001
Congo Democratic Republic	8345	Low	2013-2014	21.72 (3.55)	1.42	1.54	4.40	9.52	6.70	10.07	(5.72, 17.74)	< 0.001
Cote d'Ivoire	4576	Lower-middle	2011-2012	22.93 (4.00)	5.51	7.43	5.54	5.68	1.03	1.32	(0.57, 3.05)	0.522
Ethiopia	14089	Low	2016	20.87 (3.63)	1.43	2.24	4.89	6.27	4.38	7.52	(5.44, 10.38)	< 0.001
Gambia	4372	Low	2013	22.36 (4.68)	6.23	5.62	7.36	11.88	1.91	2.99	(1.92, 4.66)	<0.001
Ghana	4486	Lower-middle	2014	24.31 (5.07)	7.77	12.15	14.33	21.59	2.78	4.09	(2.97, 5.62)	< 0.001
Guinea	4285	Low	2012	22.26 (3.95)	3.58	5.39	6.45	9.23	2.58	4.49	(2.53, 8.00)	< 0.001
Kenya	13962	Lower-middle	2014	23.26 (4.67)	4.77	7.96	9.49	18.51	3.88	4.57	(3.60, 5.81)	< 0.001
Lesotho	3312	Lower-middle	2014	25.46 (5.61)	6.82	17.04	18.40	35.66	5.23	6.76	(2.20, 20.73)	< 0.001
Malawi	7550	Low	2015-2016	22.88 (3.95)	3.97	4.77	8.11	17.79	4.48	7.16	(4.54, 11.29)	< 0.001
Mali	4710	Low	2012-2013	22.54 (4.35)	4.37	10.47	9.31	11.11	2.54	3.30	(1.74, 6.27)	< 0.001
Mozambique	12322	Low	2011	22.73 (4.00)	1.99	5.28	8.61	15.90	7.99	9.87	(6.72, 14.49)	< 0.001
Niger	4499	Low	2012	22.31 (4.19)	3.75	9.49	6.57	20.00	5.33	5.12	(2.65, 9.91)	< 0.001
Rwanda	6313	Low	2014-2015	22.90 (3.53)	2.20	3.45	5.47	17.79	8.09	13.28	(7.50, 23.51)	< 0.001
Sao Tome	2218	Lower-middle	2008-2009	24.26 (5.35)	15.19	11.86	9.47	16.67	1.10	1.15	(0.32, 4.15)	0.834
Tanzania	12324	Low	2015-2016	23.42 (4.78)	5.67	9.41	12.73	26.77	4.72	6.35	(4.49, 8.98)	< 0.001
Togo	4456	Low	2013-2014	23.46 (4.76)	6.88	11.84	9.52	16.18	2.35	4.67	(2.98, 7.31)	< 0.001
Uganda	5562	Low	2016	22.73 (4.11)	3.91	4.31	9.24	16.17	4.14	6.67	(4.20, 10.59)	< 0.001
Zambia	15119	Lower-middle	2013-2014	22.69 (4.12)	3.18	4.20	7.26	18.62	5.86	7.04	(4.97, 9.97)	< 0.001
Zimbabwe	9365	Low	2015	24.50 (5.08)	10.19	8.53	13.55	30.45	2.99	4.23	(2.37, 7.52)	< 0.001
Africa	**174774**			**22.85 (4.46)**	**4.47**	**6.35**	**9.27**	**17.18**	**3.84**	**4.98**	**(4.66, 5.31)**	**< 0.001**
India	666021	Lower-middle	2015-2016	21.69 (4.17)	3.19	4.29	4.48	5.82	1.82	3.56	(3.42, 3.70)	< 0.001
Kyrgzy Republic	7609	Lower-middle	2012	24.21 (4.76)	0.00	5.00	11.25	12.39	12.39	13.02	(11.89, 15.36)	<0.001
Myanmar	12567	Lower-middle	2015-2016	22.49 (4.17)	3.53	5.66	5.03	7.04	1.99	2.59	(1.86, 3.61)	< 0.001
Nepal	8463	Low	2016	21.87 (4.05)	3.20	6.12	4.24	5.37	1.68	4.57	(2.97, 7.03)	< 0.001
Pakistan	4780	Lower-middle	2017-2018	25.84 (5.65)	18.34	21.65	26.75	24.90	1.36	1.50	(1.29, 1.75)	< 0.001
Tajikistan	10026	Low	2017	24.25 (5.01)	9.30	12.33	13.28	11.95	1.28	0.92	(0.56, 1.52)	0.747
Timor Leste	12010	Lower-middle	2016	20.63 (3.27)	0.98	1.77	1.52	1.6	1.63	2.77	(1.44, 5.32)	0.002
Asia	**721476**			**21.77 (4.23)**	**3.36**	**4.47**	**4.77**	**6.35**	**1.89**	**3.67**	**(3.53, 3.82)**	**< 0.001**

Bolivia	16577	Lower-middle	2008	25.88 (4.78)	17.22	22.31	15.06	11.31	0.66	1.08	(0.90, 1.30)	0.407
Haiti	9160	Low	2016-2017	23.41 (4.79)	8.24	9.87	9.76	18.73	2.27	4.45	(3.42, 5.79)	< 0.001
Honduras	21960	Lower-middle	2011-2012	25.79 (5.51)	18.97	21.31	17.95	24.36	1.28	1.75	(1.51, 2.04)	< 0.001
Latin America	47697			**25.36 (5.22)**	**14.34**	**20.06**	**14.99**	**15.61**	**1.09**	**1.69**	**(1.51, 1.88)**	**< 0.001**
Low-Income	146131			**22.74 (4.44)**	**4.32**	**6.00**	**9.37**	**13.71**	**3.17**	**5.12**	**(4.75, 5.53)**	**< 0.001**
Lower-middle Income	797628			**22.05 (4.39)**	**3.58**	**7.26**	**5.34**	**7.11**	**1.99**	**3.48**	**(3.37, 3.60)**	**< 0.001**
Combined	836721			**22.16 (4.40)**	**3.71**	**6.93**	**5.79**	**7.67**	**2.07**	**3.71**	**(3.58, 3.85)**	**< 0.001**

BMI = Body Mass Index (kg/m2), PR = Prevalence ratio between no education and higher education, APR=age-adjusted prevalence ratio between no education and higher education, CI = Confidence Interval.

DISCUSSION

This study confirmed our hypothesis that, contrary to the findings in high income countries, higher levels of education are associated with significantly higher levels of obesity among women in the majority of the analyzed LLMICs. These findings are consistent with available literature.[7; 17-18] The greatest disparities were found in Africa and in low income countries. The strengths of this study include the large sample size of nearly 1 million adult females in 34 LLMICs that were analyzed to explore the association between adult female obesity and education level. Additionally, the study uniquely categorizes the analyses of age-adjusted prevalence ratios of obesity for each of the 34 nations, three continents, and two income classes.

The study is limited by the relatively small number of countries for which data is available through the DHS dataset, and thus further research will be needed to show whether these results are generalizable to other LLMICs. Additionally, our results cannot be generalized to higher-income countries or to men in LLMICs, as we are complementing the existing literature studying similar relationships among those populations. The limited available data also does not allow us to account for intra-national variability. It is important to note that BMI does not distinguish between muscle mass, bone density, and excess fat, and may vary based on body type and race. However, it is the current best standard for determining obesity and is the metric used by the WHO.[11] Even with these limitations, the evidence that obesity is more prevalent in women with higher education in LLMICs is an interesting and important first step towards guiding future research in addressing and preventing female obesity.

Many factors may be contributing to the relationship found in this study. Higher levels of education may provide higher income opportunities allowing for greater access to surplus food. Food scarcity is higher in LLMICs, possibly resulting in lower food intake in the less educated and presumably less wealthy population, thus "protecting" this population from obesity. Higher education may also provide job opportunities that are less manual labor-intensive and therefore, less energy expenditure is required. Because of this potential relationship between education and income potential, we identified household wealth index and education as colinear variables. The relative contributions of each factor could not be disentangled by our analysis. Further study is needed to determine the contribution of household wealth on obesity. Additionally, some countries have a cultural association between higher status with larger female body size, which may contribute to obesity in the more educated population as studied in countries including Ghana, Tanzania, and Uganda.[19; 20] Studies have also shown discrepencies between self-perception of normal body weight versus actual overweight and obesity in developing countries.[21-22]

High prevalence of obesity leads to adverse implications for obesity-related disabilities and mortality, societal health consequences, and economic consequences. Our results indicate that more educated women in LLMICs face a higher prevalence of obesity. This knowledge may allow for political implementation of changes to counter this increase such as incorporating nutrition, accurate body-weight perceptions, and physical fitness into the education system. Clinicians can also play an invaluable role in educating female patients on proper nutrition, realistic body-weight perceptions, and increasing energy expenditure.

CONCLUSIONS

The finding that obesity is more prevalent in women with higher education is contrary to what is seen in high income countries, highlighting a need for more studies and public policy attention focusing on the reasons leading to the shift of the obesity burden in LLMICs. The multi-factorial relationship between female obesity and education in LLMICs requires additional investigation to determine the primary causes of this phenomenon and initiatives to address this problem. As obesity rapidly grows as a public health threat, understanding associations between obesity and education, particularly in women, will be invaluable in predicting and preventing the disorder in LLMICs.

FUNDING

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

The authors have no competing interest to declare.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors wish to thank the USAID for making their DHS data available to the public.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

Cynthia Y. Tang, Henok G. Woldu, and Lincoln R. Sheets were involved in the study concept and design, acquisition, analysis, and interpretation of the data, and drafting and revision of the article.

REFERENCES

[1]   "Obesity and Overweight," World Health Organization, 2018, https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/obesity-and-overweight (accessed Jun 2019).
[2]   Stanaway JD, Afshin A, Gakidou E, et. al. Global, regional, and national comparative risk assessment of 84 behavioural, environmental and occupational, and metabolic risks or clusters of risks for 195 countries and territories, 1990-2017: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2017, Lancet 2018; 392(10159): 1923-1994.
[3]   Hruby A, Manson JK, Qi L, et.al. Determinants and Consequences of Obesity, Am J Public Health 2016; 106(9):1656-1662.
[4]   Global Health Estimates 2016: Deaths by Cause, Age, Sex, by Country and by Region, in, World Health Organization, Geneva, 2000-2016, https://www.who.int/healthinfo/global_burden_disease/estimates/en/ (accessed Jun 2019).
[5]   Afshin A, Forouzanfar MH, Reitsma MB, et. al. Health Effects of Overweight and Obesity in 195 Countries over 25 Years, N Engl J Med 2017; 377(1): 13-27.
[6]   Goryakin Y, Suhrcke M. Economic development, urbanization, technological change and overweight: what do we learn from 244 Demographic and Health Surveys?, Economics and Human Biology 2014; 14:109-27.
[7]   Jaacks LM, Vandevijvere S, Pan A, et. al. The obesity transition: stages of the global epidemic, Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol 2019; 7(3): 231-240.
[8]   Dinsa GD, Goryakin Y, Fumagalli E, et. al. Obesity and socioeconomic status in developing countries: a systematic review, Wiley Obesity Reviews 2012; 13(11): 1067-1079.
[9]   Classifying Countries by Income: World Development Indicators, The World Bank, 2018, http://datatopics.worldbank.org/world-development-indicators/stories/the-classification-of-countries-by-income.html (accessed June 2019).
[10]   The Demographic and Health Surveys Program: United States Agency for Economic Development (USAID), 2018, https://www.dhsprogram.com/ (accessed June 2019).
[11]   Body mass index--BMI, World Health Organization, http://www.euro.who.int/en/health-topics/disease-prevention/nutrition/a-healthy-lifestyle/body-mass-index-bmi (accessed June 2019).
[12] Sheets LR, Woldu HG, Swart R, Simoes E. Urban Disadvantage, Obesity, and Underweight in 31 Lower-Income Countries. Studies in Health Technology and Informatics. In press.
[13]   World Bank Country and Lending Groups, The World Bank, 2019, https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/906519-world-bank-country-and-lending-groups (accessed June 2019).

[14] von Elm E, Altman DG, Egger M, Pocock SJ, Gotzsche PC, Vandenbroucke JP. The Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) Statement: guidelines for reporting observational studies.

[15]   T. Ostbye, R. Malhotra, and L.R. Landerman, Body mass trajectories through adulthood: results from the National Longitudinal Survey of Youth 1979 Cohort (1981-2006), Int J Epidemiol 40 (2011), 240-250.

[16]   The data analysis for this paper was generated using SAS software, Version 9.4 of the SAS System for Unix. Copyright © 2013 SAS Institute Inc. SAS and all other SAS Institute Inc. product or service names are registered trademarks or trademarks of SAS Institute Inc., Cary, NC, USA.

[17]   Kinge JM, Strand BH, Vollset SE, et. al. Educational inequalities in obesity and gross domestic product: evidence from 70 countries, J Epidemiol Community Health 2015; 69(12), 1141-1146.

[18]   Aitsi-Selmi A, Bell R, Shipley MJ, et. al. Education modifies the association of wealth with obesity in women in middle-income but not low-income countries: an interaction study using seven national datasets, 2005-2010, PLoS One 2014; 9(3): e90403.

[19]   Ofori-Asenso R, Agyema AA, Laar A, et. al. Overweight and obesity epidemic in Ghana—a systematic review and meta-analysis, BMC Public Health 2016; 16(1): 1239.

[20]   Ajayi IO, Adebamowo C, Adami HO, et. al. Urban–rural and geographic differences in overweight and obesity in four sub-Saharan African adult populations: a multi-country cross-sectional study, BMC Public Health 2016; 16(1): 1126.

[21]   Agrawal P, Gupta K, Mishra V, Agrawal S. A study on body-weight perception, future intention and weight-management behaviour among normal-weight, overweight and obese women in India, Public Health Nutr 2014; 17(4): 884-895.

[22]   Saleem MD, Ahmed G, Mulla J, et. al. Weight misperception amongst youth of a developing country: Pakistan-a cross-sectional study, BMC Public Health 2013; 13:707.

Age-Adjusted Prevalence Ratio	
0.92	27.36